DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 127 794 FL 007 886

AUTHOR Jameson, Gloria
TITLE Cross Cultural Communication through Literature: An Analysis of the Response of Foreign Students to "An Introduction to English Literature," a University General Education Course. CATESOL Occasional Papers, No. 1.
INSTITUTION California Association of Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages.
PUB DATE 74
NOTE 16p.; For related documents, see FL 007 882-888

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.83 HC-$1.67 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS College Curriculum; *Course Evaluation; *Cultural Awareness; Cultural Education; *English (Second Language); Foreign Students; Higher Education; *Language Instruction; Language Skills; Literature; *Literature Appreciation; Modern Language Curriculum; Poetry; Reading Materials; Second Language Learning; Short Stories; Teaching Methods

ABSTRACT

This paper describes the use of literature in an English as a second language course, and the response of foreign students to such a procedure. The responses of 113 students from 20 different countries, speaking twenty-four languages, were compared with those of thirty-five American students having English as their first language. The course consisted of readings in poetry, drama, and short stories, accompanied by discussion and written analyses. Reading selections were from the recent past, so that they would be modern in language and content and related to current life, and yet far enough removed to be seen as a pattern and examined as such. Both multiple choice tests and essays were used for evaluation purposes. Tapes and films were also used to supplement instruction. It was found that students enjoyed the course and felt stimulated to read more. Students suggested having more discussion and student participation in the choice of test materials. Test scores indicated that reasoning and writing in English were the most difficult tasks encountered by non-native speakers. Scores also pointed to the relative importance of a given literary form in a given culture. (CLK)

****
* Documents acquired by ERIC include many informal unpublished *
* materials not available from other sources. ERIC makes every effort *
* to obtain the best copy available. Nevertheless, items of marginal *
* reproducibility are often encountered and this affects the quality *
* of the microfiche and hardcopy reproductions ERIC makes available *
* via the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). EDRS is not *
* responsible for the quality of the original document. Reproductions *
* supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original. *
****

ED127794

FL007886

U S DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

CROSS CULTURAL COMMUNICATION THROUGH LITERATURE
An Analysis of the Response of Foreign Students to "An Introduction to English Literature," a University General Education Course

Gloria Jameson
California Polytechnic State University, San Luis Obispo

In his essay "Literature in Language Teaching,"[1] Archibald Hill examines the tradition which gives the study of literature an important place in the language classroom and discusses ways of implementing this study in our rapidly changing world. He presents the content of literature as that part of the culture which its people wish to preserve. What language says is termed an anthropoligical description. How the language is used, the way in which literature sets it off from ordinary talk--its form--is termed a linguistic description. The foreign student response analyzed in this paper reflects both areas. The study used an introductory course in American and English literature to evaluate the response of 113 foreign students, representing twenty countries and speaking twenty-four languages, and compare it with the response of 35 American students who spoke English as their first language.[2] The tests measured both specific information and the understanding of concepts, following the presentation of poetry, drama, and two groups of short stories. An ESL/EFL section of this general education course has been taught by the author for six years. The course is listed as a degree requirement in general education by a number of departments in the University. Classes meet three hours a week for a quarter of 12 weeks. Student enrollment averages 25-28 in this section. A few American students choose this section, and some foreign students select sections planned for native English speakers. The four classroom tests were used as part of a continuing effort to improve class presentations and the students' learning experience.

For many people "literature is above all a source of pleasure, of individual hope, and therefore new energy."[3] Pleasure, hope and energy are greatly needed by the foreign student struggling to acquire information and understanding that the majority of his associates seem to possess inately and use to their advantage. This source of energy and the "sense of fact" that T. S. Eliot viewed as the essence of criticism,[4] can be made available to those studying literature in a second or third language only when real communication takes place. When this happens, as it seems to for some students each quarter, the instructor facilitating the experience shares the feeling of delight and renewal.

The attempt to facilitate this communication of pleasure, of renewal, of the "sense of fact" has been made in a state polytechnic university using the quarter system. It provides an introductory short session, twenty-five lecture and four testing periods of fifty minutes. The dominant language backgrounds of the foreign students electing the ESL/EFL section are Chinese (Hong Kong, Taiwan, Singapore), Urdu (West Pakistan), and Farsi (Iran).

An average of 25 students, usually men between the ages of 20-35, completed the literature class each quarter. One or two young women and a few European students were enrolled each year. Most students entered the class as seniors, although it is listed in the catalog at the sophomore level. Many postpone taking the course until their graduating quarter because they feel unable to maintain an acceptable grade point average in a literature course in a second or third language. A large number of students are transfers who completed their first two years of work in a community junior college. These students had usually taken no English on campus (where special sections of freshman composition and technical writing/advanced composition are offered), nor any courses out of their technical fields for the previous two years. Two quarters or one semester of freshman English is listed as a prerequisite for students enrolling in the literature course.

Because of the differing language backgrounds and levels of English skill, the instructor usually administered a test for fluency in English during the first class period. The university admission policy accepts an entering foreign student whose score is 500 on TOEFL (Test of English as a Foreign Language) or 85 on the Michigan Test of English Language Proficiency.[6] Class administration of the short Michigan Test, Form A, however, produced a number of scores below 85.

Students in the class felt the need to communicate and achieve in English since they were required to live, work, and compete for grades with American students. For many the ability to communicate in English successfully would continue to parallel their vocational advancement. In the first class periods the relationship of English literature to their life and vocational goals seemed remote to the majority of students. Yet, since understanding and communicating in English were important for the achievement of these goals, they were ready to question ideas of personal freedom, cultural heritage, national goals, racism, political systems, war, poverty, affluence, and the individual's needs as these were reflected in their reading materials.

Pocket books similar to those easily available in super markets and drug stores were selected as texts, with a paperback guide to literary study.[7] For $5, or less if used copies were purchased, the student had a wide range of reading material in American and English literature. Additional poems and other information, and the four tests, were duplicated for class use. In presenting the material to the students the instructor emphasized the values, ideas, and ways of life the western Europeans had developed since the time of ancient Greece and handed on in the United States as the dominant settlers, and the way English poetry, drama, and short stories reflected this cultural heritage. The selections studied were taken from the recent past--modern in language and content and related to current life--yet far enough removed to be seen as a pattern and examined.

The course began with poetry in 1970-1971, since it was the oral language and culture of a people given pattern, rhythm, in order to be remembered and handed on. Richard Eberhart's comments,[8] Archibald MacLeish's 'Ars Poetica,'[9] and Marianne Moore's 'Poetry,'[10] were used in the first discussion; later, Hill's analysis of the popularity of Joyce Kilmer's 'Trees'[11] was used as a

reflection of American cultural and moral values. Four of the five sections of Niebling's A Journey of Poems, and some class experimentation writing haiku, cinquain, limerics, and rhymes, were part of the three-and-a-half week study. Following introductory comments on each of the four sections from which material in Niebling was used, the instructor read poems aloud and guided discussion of their content and form. Each student selected a sonnet and a lyric for detailed study and a written analysis. The first draft of the first analysis was read and marked and returned before the student wrote the analysis submitted for a grade. His analysis was graded and returned before his second analysis was submitted, which in some instances was written in class as part of the test that concluded the study of poetry. The analysis of the test papers shows an average of 77% correct responses for foreign students, 75% correct responses for American students in their review performance in English/American poetry. Table II gives the details of the analysis.

'Lost in the Stars'[12] was the first drama read by the class. It was selected as an example of tragedy because some students usually had read or seen Alan Polton's 'Cry, the Beloved Country,' and because most students are sensitive to racial, economic, and political issues, the need for justice and concern for man as a person, and because Maxwell Anderson and Kurt Weill give a strong, sensitive reflection of these universal issues in their musical drama. A tape of the highlights from the chorus, songs, and dialog, with the original Broadway cast, was made for class use, with copies that the students could check out. The use of the chorus to contribute to the understanding and atmosphere of the drama provided an illustration of the ancient Greek drama form discussed in the literary handbook's introduction to this genre. The music and dialog made a noticeable impact on many class members.

'The Member of the Wedding,' by Carson McCullers,[13] was read in the form first produced at the Empire Theatre, New York City, in 1950. It was selected as a comedy because it portrays life in the southern United States during World War II, a period about which most foreign students have some information, and because the situation on which the plot is built, the dialog of the main characters, and Frankie's adolescent behavior reflect humor that can be understood by foreign students. Loneliness, racism, and the pain of adolescence are also shown, yet the students were less deeply involved than they were in 'Lost in the Stars,' even when they spoke of their similar experiences in the recent past. Another important consideration was the availability of the film for a reasonable rental, so that it could often be shown to the class following the reading of the play.

The tape and the film aided in drawing students into this area of study. Sparks of interest and pleasure were often evident in class sessions, discussions were more lively, and in later contacts students often referred to their enjoyment of the plays, their feeling for Stephen, and the world's need for racial understanding.

The test over this portion of the course showed an average of 74% correct responses by foreign students, 78% by American students. Details are shown on Table II.

Eighty-two of the 113 foreign students said that 'Lost in the Stars' appealed to them more than 'The Member of the Wedding,' and five said that both dramas appealed strongly. Only one negative comment was made on each drama: a Punjabi student from India through'too much happened and it was too far from reality,' of 'Lost in the Stars,' and a Chinese student said of the other play, 'I was confused by Frankie; the way she acted seems abnormal.'

To see the native language and culture in relation to their comments, papers of Chinese, Farsi, Urdu, Spanish, and Black African students have their comments identified in the listing of student responses in Table III.

Fifteen short stories were selected from Short Story Masterpieces for class use.[14] Two stories were usually discussed each class period, and the performance test administered following the study of the first eight stories was similar to those given for poetry and drama, requiring the student to express his understanding of the subject in writing. This was always difficult for the few students with very limited ability in English, and those who needed more time to think out what they wanted to say complained that they did not have enough time to finish the tests. In the last two quarters, therefore, the instructor administered a multiple choice test over the second group of seven short stories. Fifty questions were prepared, with a choice of three answers, in seven groups for the seven stories. The student marked his choice on a printed form that was later corrected with a grid.

Performance on the first short story test showed that the foreign students averaged 75% correct responses and the American students 84% when the answers were written. On the multiple choice test covering the second group of short stories the foreign students had 84% correct responses, the American students 86%. The addition of a ten-point essay question to the multiple choice test taken by 2 foreign students lowered their average to 80% correct responses.

Although the multiple choice test is easier for students to take, and easy to administer and score, it has the shortcomings of offering no opportunity for individual expression, and less indication of the individual's understanding of the subject than the written response. A combination of the two types of tests is planned for recording student performance in the future.

One of the goals of the instructor was to introduce a new genre only when 80% of the class had a correct response to 80% of the material that had been presented. This goal was approximated in most classes. When it was not reached, it seemed better to touch poetry, drama, and short stories in the one English literature course many of the foreign students would ever take than to extend the period required to reach the goal and omit one of the three areas. Poetry continues to be the most difficult genre, although it is the one most closely related to the native literature of many of the foreign students. For this reason it has been presented first in 1970-71, instead of last, as in 1968-69. This seems to be a more satisfactory class procedure from the instructor's viewpoint, and students have not suggested a change in their evaluations at the conclusion of the class. In the next quarter the

instructor plans to ask for more information in regard to this approach in the student evaluations.

The foreign students who responded to the request to evaluate the course usually said that they enjoyed it, that they were interested and stimulated to read more, found poetry difficult, and some commented that the class might spend less time on poetry, studying fewer poems. The evaluations given by previous classes were read and noted but not kept. Most of the American students taught in the fall of 1971, in one class with 6, and a second class with 7 foreign students, wrote a paragraph to a page in evaluating the class. Their general comments were that they enjoyed the course, recognized that all the needs of all the students could not be met, would like more student discussion and participation in the choice of the text material used, thought that class objectives were clear and the tests fair, and suggested that a novel or additional poems, dramas, and short stories be read for additional credit.

The comments of (1) a foreign student, (2) a sophomore American student whose entering placement test removed the requirement that he take freshman English, (3) three average American students and (4) one weak American student are quoted in the last footnote.[15] Student evaluations have been used in planning the next E.S.L. and regular sections of the literature class. American students will have a more open structure, more opportunity for discussion and participation in the selection of the text material to be read, and the opportunity for outside reading for additional credit. The E.S.L. section will attempt to incorporate more of this student participation, and the opportunity of outside reading for additional credit will be offered. The tests will be revised to eliminate weak questions and review the material that is covered in each class.

Examining the scores of the students whose native language and culture differ from those of the literature they studied, and the scores of native students, shows that the non-native students maintained a high level of achievement. It seems significant that their highest mean was attained in poetry, the characteristic form of much of their literature, especially in the Near-East and Asia. Their score of 77, in comparison with the American students' 75, is also a commentary on the place of poetry in American culture (the American students' lowest score).

Where memorization could be a factor, e.g. in matching vocabulary items with definitions, analyzing a poem previously selected and studied, listing and identifying elements of drama, most Asian students made high scores. This again reflects their cultural pattern of memorization of literary classics and rote learning.

As was anticipated, reasoning and writing in English were the most difficult tasks for the non-native student. Although their scores were lower than those of the American students they were still strikingly high in nearly all categories. Contributing factors could be that in general great motivation, skill, and competency are required for the foreign student to be admitted and remain in college, with more serious negative consequences for his poor performance or failure.

The high scores of the foreign students in their response to all three genres of English literature indicate that they were able to grasp English literary conventions as well as cultural understandings different from their own. It was necessary to see these in equivalent relationships, or associations with meaning and relevance, to achieve as they did. It can be concluded that cross cultural communication did, in fact, occur.

FOOTNOTES

[1]Hill, Archibald A. 1965. Literature in language teaching. Essays in literary analysis. Austin. 76-88.

[2]Chinese (Hong Kong, Singapore, Taiwan) 34; Urdu (W. Pakistan) 16; Farsi (Iran) 15; Spanish (Latin America) 8; India (Hindi 3, Punjabi 2, Gujarati 2, Malayalam 1) 8; Arabic 6; Korean 6; Thai 3; Pidgin English (Hawaii) 2; Black Africa (Amharic 1, Yoruba 2, Ibo 2, Luganda 1, Kikiyu 1) 7; Japanese 4; Vietnamese 2; Greek 1; Italian 1; Armenian 1; Illocano (Philippines) 1. The tests were administered 1970-71.

[3]Kazin, Alfred. "Professors are too sophisticated." Saturday Review. May 22, 1971. 23.

[4]Ibid.

[5]E.S.L. -- English as a second language.

[6]University of Michigan. 1965. Michigan test of English language proficiency, Form A.

Test of English as a foreign language. Educational Testing Service. Princeton, New Jersey. (T.O.E.F.L.)

[7]Niebling, Richard, ed. 1966. A Journey of Poems. New York: Dell #4271

Hewes, Henry, ed. 1967. Famous American Plays of the 1940's. New York: Dell #2490.

Warren, Robert P. & Erskine, Albert, etc. 1966. Short Story Masterpieces. New York: Dell #7864.

Dickinson, Leon T. 1959. A Guide to Literary Study. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston. or

Cohen, B. Bernard. 1963. Writing About Literature. New York: Scott, Foresman.

[8]Eberhart, Richard. 1969. "The Function of Poetry". MLA newsletter. I:4.

[9]MacLeish, Archibald. Ars Poetica. Sound and Sense, Laurence Perrine, 134. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World.

[10]Moore, Mariane. Poetry. Introduction to Literature: Poems, Altenbernd and Lewis, 399. New York: Macmillan.

[11]Hill, Archibald. op. cit.

[12]Anderson, Maxwell. "Lost in the Stars" Famous American Plays of the 1940's, Hewes, 289-369.

[13]McCullers, Carson. "The Member of the Wedding". Ibid. 371-447.

[14]Group I: Aiken, C., "Impulse"; Algren, N., "A Bottle of Milk for Mother"; Anderson, S., "The Egg"; Collier, J., "Witch's Money"; Conrad, J., "An Outpost of Progress"; Crane, S., "The Bride Comes to Yellow Sky"; Faulkner, W., "Barn Burning"; Fitzgerald, F. S., "Winter Dreams".
Group II: James, h., "The Tree of Knowledge"; Joyce, J., "The Boarding House"; Lawrence, D. H., "The Horse Dealer's Daughter"; McCullers, C., "The Sojourner"; 'Saki' (H.H. Munro) "The Open Window"; O'Connor, F., "My Oedipus Complex; Steinbeck, J., "Flight." Op. cit.

[15]Foreign student: "This class was taught in such a method or level which I gain more than otherwise. Learning structure of poem and short stories and etc. has helped me understand literature more. Learning what to look for in any type of pleasure reading helps to understand more."

American student with superior background: "This course attempts to present an overall introduction of the various facets of literature, and I feel it adequately does this. Unfortunately much material must be covered. Perhaps less varied material, such as limiting only to poetry and S.S., would enable the students to learn in depth one or two facets only, rather than skim several without leaving any lasting impression of any.

"More student participation in the form of discussions would further enable learning. I think discussion in your class was too one-sided, but perhaps of necessity."

American students, average background: (1) "This is good in the way it stimulates reading. The amount of reading of short stories is too limited. The book Short Story Masterpieces is not that long that it could not be read in entirity, beside it has some very good stories. I'm not really fond of poetry or drama but I think I'm about average in interest this way.

"As far as the instructor goes, _____ is good. She adds a lot of understanding to the harder reading topics. Tests are good, the right number and about the right length, if you have done the assigned readings."

(2) "Little student oral participation was encouraged. Texts were good. Testing wasn't a fair evaluation system. Subject was covered well and interesting. I don't think it should be a required course. Subject matter was interesting and well chosen."

(3) "Class was fun, very representative of the types of literature and methods of evaluation. The poetry was very good. The plays were okay, but nothing too inspiring. The short stories are the most enjoyable as the reading and analysis of them is worthwhile. A novel of the students choice for an extra credit report would be fun. One could make a comparison between a novel and a short story and a poem by some of the writers. The tests are fair evaluations."

American student with weak background: "After study of poetry the course became more interesting to me. You certainly gave enough help in class, plus you were always available during office hours. If a man is a poor reader, native speaker or not, I think it is a very hard task to make them study the assignments and read. Perhaps reading aloud might help some students. Your teaching techniques were very good as far as I am concerned. It's not your fault for people being poor readers & not wanting to read. I don't think any instructor could have done any better."

[16]Among U.S.A. students 33 or 35 chose to answer the vocabulary question rather than the sonnet analysis, leaving an insufficient number for analysis.

[17]45 foreign students responded to this item, 41 selecting Millay's sonnet "The Broken Dike," 3 selecting Corke's "The Choice", Journey of Poems, 128-130. op. cit.

[18]This item was not in the test given 61 foreign students and 35 U.S.A. students.

[19]21 foreign and 15 American students were confused and discussed the development of a plot instead of the elements of drama.

TABLE I

Summary of foreign student and American student performance on poetry, drama, and short story tests.

Genre		Percent Correct Foreign	U.S.A.
Poetry:	Average score	77	75
1.	Vocabulary: matching definitions	78	73
2.	Analysis of sonnet student chose	77	--[16]
3.	Analysis of lyric student chose	83[17]	80
4.	Analysis of new poem instructor chose	85	-[18]
5.	Recognition of poetic characteristics in new material instructor chose	60	62
6.	Explanation of literal and figurative meanings in new material instructor chose	77	83
Drama:	Average score	74	78
1.	Vocabulary: writing definitions	76	90
2.	Discussion of elements of drama	69[19]	53[19]
3.	Ways "Lost in the Stars" illustrates the definition of tragedy	75	87
4.	Ways "The Member of the Wedding" illustrates definition of comedy	77	87
5.	Identification of protagonist and outline of the plot of the tragedy	75	78
Short Stories:	Average score, Test I (similar to written tests for poetry and drama)	75	84
1.	Vocabulary	81	85
2.	Illustration of vocabulary definitions in stories	61	81
3.	Illustration of different points of view in stories	73	77
4.	Discussion of theme of a story	89	90
5.	Outline of a plot development	69	88
Short Stories:	Score on Test II, multiple choice, 50 questions	84	86
	Score when 10 point essay question was included for 25 foreign students	80	

TABLE II

DETAIL OF FOREIGN STUDENT PERFORMANCE in An Introductory Course to English/American Literature

Genre	Percent Correct Response: Foreign	U.S.A.
I. POETRY (113 foreign, 36 U.S.A. students)		
1. Vocabulary: matching definitions	78	73
2. Analysis of sonnet student chose (96 foreign a,b,e,f; 50 c,d; 47 g)		
a. Identify poem as sonnet	92	
b. Describe structure, or literal paraphrase	79	
c. Describe connotations, figurative meanings	76	
d. Identify figures of speech	80	
e. Show end rhyme, pattern if any	77	
f. Mark strong stress in meter	61	
g. Memorize and write the sonnet	68	
3. Analysis of lyric student chose (45 foreign: 35 U.S.A.)		
a. Identify poem as lyric	100	94
b. Describe structure, or literal paraphrase	80	80
c. Describe connotations, figurative meanings	91	77
d. Identify and explain figures of speech	76	--
e. Show end rhyme, pattern if any	76	80
f. Mark strong stress in meter	77	69
g. Describe imagery or musical characteristics	84	80
4. Analysis of new poem (45 foreign)		
a. Identify structure of poem, explain choice (41 "The Broken Dyke",E.S. Millay; 3 "The Choice", H. Corke; 1 no attempt; 98% made choice; 82% chose sonnet; 87% explained choice)	87	
b. Describe structure, or literal paraphrase	84	
c. Identify and explain figures of speech	77	
d. Show end rhyme, pattern if any	89	

5.	Recognition of poetic characteristics in new material instructor chose (62 foreign) ("Counting-out Rhyme", E.S. Millay)		
	a. Show example of assonance	63	63
	b. Show example of alliteration	53	46
	c. Show example of consonance	37	27
	d. Show internal rhyme	69	77
	e. Show repetition	79	86
6.	Explanation of literal and figurative meaning (62 foreign)("Stopping by Woods", Robert Frost)		
	a. Why the man stopped	74	80
	b. What roused the man, to go on his way	55	60
	c. The reasons the man goes on	84	94
	d. Why the last lines are repeated	82	97
	e. What "miles to go" and "before I sleep" might mean	90	83
II.	DRAMA (113 foreign)		
1.	Vocabulary: writing 6 definitions		
	a. Wrote 6 (62 foreign, 21 USA.)	55	60
	b. Wrote 5 (21 " 9 ")	20	26
	c. Wrote 4 (19 " 4 ")	16	11
	d. Wrote 3 (4 " 1 ")	4	3
	e. Wrote 2 (5 " ")	4	
	f. Wrote 1 (2 " ")	1	
2.	Discussed 4 elements of drama presented in literary guide		
	a. Setting	70	53
	b. Characters	65	39
	c. Dialog	68	44
	d. Plot (19% foreign and 42% U.S.A. outlined plot development instead of drama elements)	74	56
3.	Ways "Lost in the Stars" illustrates definition of tragedy (15 points possible, 38 foreign and 20 U.S.A. achieved this; all made 5 or more points; average score foreign, 11.2, U.S.A. 12.6)	75	87

4. Ways "The Member of the Wedding" illustrates definition of comedy (10 points possible, achieved by 38 foreign, 20 U.S.A.; 1 foreign and 3 U.S.A. scored 0; average score foreign 7.7; U.S.A. 8.7)	77	87
5. Identification of protagonist and outline of plot of tragedy (20 points possible, achieved by 8 foreign and 9 U.S.A.; 1 foreign scored 0, a total of 5 scored under 6; no U.S.A. score under 6; average score, foreign 14.9; U.S.A. 15.6)	75	78
V. Short Stories - Test I (similar to poetry and drama tests; written responses)		
1. Vocabulary: writing definitions (16 points possible, achieved by 24 foreign, 12 U.S.A. students; 3 foreign and 1 U.S.A. scored under 7; average score, foreign 13; U.S.A. 13.5)	81	85
2. Illustration of vocabulary definitions in stories (25 points possible, achieved by 2 foreign, 9 U.S.A.; 12 foreign and 1 U.S.A. scored under 10; average score, foreign 15.2; U.S.A. 20.2)	61	81
3. Illustration of differnet points of views in stories (10 points possible, achieved by 15 foreign, 13 U.S.A.; 10 foreign and 4 U.S.A. scored under 5; average score, foreign 7.3; U.S.A. 7.7)	73	77
4. Discussion of theme of a story (10 points possible, achieved by 64 foreign, 24 U.S.A.; 4 foreign and 1 U.S.A. no response; average score, foreign 8.9; U.S.A. 9.0)	89	90
5. Outline of development of a plot (18 points possible, achieved by 11 foreign, 21 U.S.A.; 6 foreign, 1 U.S.A. no attempt; 17 foreign, 1 U.S.A. score under 10; average, foreign 9.4; U.S.A. 15.7)	69	88
Test II (38 foreign; 35 U.S.A.)		
Multiple choice, 50 questions (median score, foreign students 42; U.S.A. 43; when 25 foreign students had an essay question as part of this test their correct response average dropped to 80%)	84	86

TABLE III

STUDENT COMMENTS ON THE DRAMAS STUDIED:
WHICH PLAY APPEALED MORE, AND WHY?

Chinese, Farsi, Urdu, Spanish, and Black African responses are indicated.

FOREIGN STUDENTS (113: no response, 1 student)

"Lost in the Stars" (82: 19 Chinese, 7 Farsi, 8 Urdu, 4 Spanish, and 3 Black Africans)

		Number Comments
1.	Plot well developed, holds interest to climax; dialog more intellectual. C 8; F 2; U 1; S 1	15
2.	Deals with racial discrimination, with black and white problem in South America. C 14; F 3; U 4; S 3	42
3.	Social message universal -- our need to create a better society. C 2; F 1; U 3; S 4	15
4.	Tragedy changes people and their values, and makes the reader more involved personally because realistic. C 7; F 6; U 4; S 1	27
5.	Moral struggle; stresses reconciliation, which the world needs. C 4; F 1; S 1	5
6.	Justice is an issue. C 6; U 1; S 2; BA 1	12
7.	Rich development of characters. C 4	4
8.	Shows love of father for son. U 1; S 1; BA 1	4
9.	Reaches heart; makes us ashamed as men for not: a. breaking down wall separating religions, fellowman. b. loving humans more than pets. C 4; U 3; BA 2	10
10.	Symbolism of the title and song as a folk tale. BA 1	1
11.	Easy to understand. BA 1	1
12.	Very hard emotional impact, sensitivity and warmth. C 6; F 1; U 5; BA 1	20
13.	First play read in English; enjoyed it more than poetry	1
14.	Had read "Cry the Beloved Country"	3

"The Member of the Wedding" (30: 9 Chinese, 7 Farsi, 5 Urdu, 3 Spanish, 1 Black African)

1.	Reminded me of when I was that age. C 2; F 2; S 1	5
2.	Usual child, living in own dream world as we all sometimes do, wanting things, but we don't know, get a close look. C 3; F 2; S 2	17
3.	Shows inside loneliness of young people. C 2; F 4; U 2	12

4. Easy to read and understand. C 1 6

5. Comedy, fun; tragic aspects but enjoyable to read, fun, touching, and sad. C 7 8

6. True of a girl growing up; of all of us. F 1; U 2; BA 2 8

7. Dialog witty and sentimental. C 1; F 1; S 1; BA 1 7

8. Human psychology shown. F 1 2

9. A look at everybody in the first scene; marvelous and enjoyable comedy. 1

10. Enjoyed movie I had already seen. 1

11. Reflects U.S.A. at one period 1

12. Warmth and greatness of Bernice. F 2 3

13. I like to be entertained, relax, prefer comedy -- and it can say as much. S 1 1

U.S.A. STUDENTS (36: 3 liked both)

"Lost in the Stars" (27)

1. It dealt with the racial issue, problems of black and white. 10

2. The atmosphere was real; it dealt with reality. 7

3. I was involved in the play, problem. 7

4. Tragedy is more involved, says more; a serious play with the theme of life and death 5

5. Social comment, justice, relationships of people come alive and show man's trouble with his beliefs. 5

6. Shows moral issues, struggle with conscience; Stephen shows these; Stephen sees, understands, keeps picking up the pieces. 5

7. Absalom was about my age; the hero; I could understand him; he was my kind of man--kept screwing up but was good. 3

8. Strong identity with Stephen; Stephen was 'the' person throughout the drama, it kept showing. 3

9. It arouses the emotions, has warmth and depth. 2

10. Very dramatic, beautiful in way it was written. 2

11. Exciting story, profound plot, entertaining reading experience; I don't read much literature like this play. Plot would be interesting to produce. 3

12. Music from tape helped make real, enjoy; especially listening to it at home I was involved and sad, identified with each character. 2

13. Enjoyed both, but more involved in tragedy, its powerful conclusion with good prevailing. 3

"The Member of the Wedding" (6)

1.	I identify with the actions; it was closer home.	2
2.	Not as sad.	1
3.	I dislike musicals, thought this was a poor musical.	1
4.	Humorous, didn't require involvement; I have no time to get involved, and can understand Frankie.	1
5.	Real, more believable; showed loneliness of growing up, people.	2
6	Dealt with maturing, inner conflict, what to do and when; I am close to her age.	2